

B.

Drawing Models:

B.

Drawing Model B:

28.04.2019. - 19.05.2018. Five Years.

Assembly: Drawing on a transcribed conversation between Edward Dorrian and Nela Milic.

Close conversation recorded and now replayed at Five Years. Openly edited between participants and interested publics. As invitation for anyone to interrupt.

- E. Nela, apologies for the long hiatus... and short notice. I'm planning to be in the space at Five Years on Sun 28 April 12-6pm, ostensibly going through a first draft of our conversation last May, as a kind of performative exercise. I only recently sent the recording off to be transcribed by a third party. I've attached their transcription and the recording. I don't expect you to proof or necessarily participate on the Sunday (short notice) but I wondered if you'd allow me to sit in a 'public' place... transcribing? I haven't gone through it in any way. If a completed second draft does arrive...and it won't happen in the few hours... I will of course discuss with you any further plans... before any proper publication/ development. Let me know if you've any queries...
- N. Hello Edward, Thank you for your email. I do not think I will be able to get to you on the 28th, but I am happy to be informed about your progress with the project. I just went through the transcript quickly and it is quite chaotic. I hope you can get what you need out of it as it goes everywhere, but we were in a good mood and that comes across very well!

Recording made at Five Years as part of Being Together Is Not Enough*

Saturday 19 May 2018 12-1pm / Nela Milic & Edward Dorrian

- N. I am thinking of a joined reading group session between us – you can allocate the reading this time – design collectives like Assemble are an interesting case – Turner prize for quality or self-promotion of Turner prize as a do-good bunch? Sincerely, Nela Milic.
- E. Thanks Nela. Not sure how/if this'll work out. Here's a proposal for a kind of drawing group:

[Camera held in assembly. Capturing image and sound. Both in and beyond frame. Drawing begins when the camera/apparatus is switched on? Performing in and with. In front of and behind. The drawing is a continuous movement. Time. In recording. However imperfect. Or incomplete. An artificial thing that exists. Contrived between. A (drawing) practice as the relationship/connection between... making, performing and participating.] Sit for one hour as a group. We record ourselves in turn. For an amount of time (perhaps 5 mins). We each use the camera. (Framing, close up, panning, zoom in and out, etc). Passing the video camera amongst us... Discussion is not lead. There is no declared starting point. No proposition. Each participant operates before and behind the camera. There is no compulsion to speak, act, etc. A transcription of any discussion will be attempted. A draft of the transcription is offered to any participant to edit (their own contribution only). A text comprising of the first draft and a second combined edit will be proposed for publication. The text remains copyrighted to the participants. The recording will not played back at the event. The recording is the copyright of those participating. Consent must be given for its future presentation or subsequent editing.

Reading material:

Assemble, <https://assemblestudio.co.uk/about>

Tate, <http://www.tate.org.uk/whats-on/other-venue/exhibition/turner-prize-2015/> Charlotte Higgins, Turner prize winners Assemble: 'Art? We're more interested in plumbing _ The Guardian, Tue 8 Dec 2015 18.28 GMT, Last modified on Thu 22 Feb 2018 17.20 GMT <https://www.theguardian.com/artanddesign/2015/dec/08/assemble-turner-prize-architects-are-we-artists/> Gerald Raunig, *Instituent Practices: Fleeing, Instituting, Transforming*, 2006, Translated by Aileen Derieg <http://eicpc.net/transversal/0106/raunig/en> Gerald Raunig, *Dividuum and Condividuality, Dilemmas of the community (Politics of the One)* 2013/ Dean Kenning, *Art Relations and the Presence of Absence, Third Text*, Vol.23 Issue 4, July 2009

Nela Milic: Boothique 2017: Somewhere in Between: LCC Space and Place Research Hub Residency at Elephant & Castle Shopping Centre <https://spaceandplace.lcc.wordpress.com/2017/03/30/somewhere-in-between-lcc-space-and-place-research-hub-residency-at-elephant-castle-shopping-centre/>
Boothique: The threshold of public and private space over the course of Nela's artists' residency in the ground floor studio off Walworth Road in 2012 became a world opener to both sides – her at home and people on the street. Nela won Southwark Community Art Award in 2015 for this project. Nela aims to use the same method by interacting with the local residents for a public reading of her book chapter about the project at the LCC studio, offering passers-by the opportunity to engage with our hub activities and our own artistic work. Nela would record, exhibit and talk about this experience and research into the locality at the Q&A the hub would have at the end of our event activities.

Dr Nela Milic is an artist and senior lecturer in the Design School at London College of Communication.

Edward Dorrian is an artist and member of Five Years (organising ~~Being Together is not Enough~~.) He is currently a candidate PhD student at Kingston School of Art - Working out of a contested common ground: A politics of drawing as collectivity and organisation.

* ~~Being Together is not Enough~~.
Five Years Call for proposals 2018, organised by Edward Dorrian

Proposals are particularly welcome that attempt to radically interpret participatory activities and question organisational models of public events (including workshops, talks, lectures, discussion, reading groups, religious and political groups, performances, walks, exhibits, lessons, conferences, groups for and by: local residents, workers, artists, school children, activists, academics, researchers, designers, etc. ie anyone). Proposals that attempt to operate outside formal institutions, that build on other self-organised events and actions are of course welcome too. As are previously independently published materials that can be presented here for further discussion.

22.05.18.

22.05.18. Date Transcribed: 8th March 2019

1. Used to be
2. To buy this house.
3. [Phone rings]
4. Ah smashing
5. [0:03 answers phone – conversation not transcribed]
6. It's my... it's my best mate. I have to take when she calls because... she has a little girl so the the two seconds she can talk... I'm delighted to hear her [laughs].
7. Where is she?
8. She is here but ... her daughter is very demanding so
9. What age?
10. Three.
11. Do you have children?
12. No.
13. No.
14. No... I would love to though so yeah... I think it would be one of my best projects but hey... it's not happening [laughs].
15. It's not happening why... no hat's another story
16. Yeah [laughs]
17. And you also you to have the ask the... the project itself and how that might... how that might work out. ...well the idea... I don't know... 'cause I don't know whether it's going really going to work is to somehow pass the camera between us while we are talking
18. Ok.
19. ...and that part of that would be just a a kind of a negotiation... of the of the terms of which you've set out however tentatively.
20. Yeah.
21. Because you've... you've [pause] signalled or put out an alert saying "what is thing thing? What is this thing?" ...and you were speaking on the phone with sort of. Well maybe you would like to... maybe you should introduce just what it was about Assemble... what it was about forensic architecture and its relations... which I'm assuming is what you're kind of considering its relations to you institution of... of art itself and specifically the way in which the Turner Prize operates.
22.
23. as indicative of a particular practice
24.
25. How it is considered ...institutionally

26.
27. It seems... that seems a kind of
a... an unavoidable and deliberate
.....dynamic of what it is you're
28.
29. Questioning or querying.
30.
31. ...and obviously when you're
asking me to sort of come up with a
reading matter ...part of my interest
is I guess has always been about
the... a backlog of institutional
critique... how it operates within
...informed... is informed by
various ...discussions... debates
and current practice or theoretically
through etcetera etcetera. Through
the you know... all the relat...
relational aesthetics... through
...I was thinking [unclear 3:13]
32.
33. ...instituant [?:18] practice. ...I
mean I'm just starting a kind of a
PhD myself ...and it's part time...
I'm doing it down at Kingston
and it's... in some ways... it's
not a PhD by publication where
I'm looking back on projects that
I've been involved in but it is a
certainly informal. And so one of
my questions is around... which
could be a question of methodology
and about drawing... drawing and
participatory activity collectivity.
34. Ok.
35. And it something that's [pause]
...yeah this is not really going...
how does this work... because
it stops everything. ...
36. You can just use a phone as well.
37. The performative aspect
of... of how we engage
38.
39. And I wondered whether that was
a kind of residual question that
keeps on coming up... between
this idea of politics of an activist
dichotomy between. I mean an old
question of of... of art... aesthetics
and politics. And it's something
that kind of seems to come up and
addressed in ...time and time again
and with... in particular ...whether
there's an ethical dimension that's...
that's... that's related within the
question of forensic architecture?
40. Mmm...
41. And that it's dilemmas. And
that was a thing that could
kind of ...leaps off the page
42. Mmm...
43. The discomfort or the

- place of ...of activity
44. Mmm...
45. And I wonder whether in some ways whether that was what you were wanting to draw out or whether that was... it was its... its positioning in relation to how the art world as such alights on a particular dilemma or a particular way in which you've then... seeks to co-opt itself within a current discourse as a way of validating how it continues. ... it's either its relevance or it's and it's this also en en... encompassing place where artists themselves almost kind of avoid allowing themselves to be co-opted or whether it is as... as other aspects of institutional critique describe. I'm thinking of whether it's Fraser or whether it's ... or whether the institution of art has a way... it's actually ...central to... to what art is that is... this thing. So that's one of the reasons why the kind of... the dichotomy between say something like [unclear 6:47] or where there's a notion of an aesthetic that ...acts... at least this is where I'm not entirely clear... sure myself... acts in relation to a politic which is somehow itself outside of itself which is something that can should necess... doesn't necessarily have to be ...subsumed and is particular But there's a dis... there is an actual discomfort in itself that that's of itself. I don't know how to attempt it.
46. So I'm holding it?
47. Yeah... you can
48. And like
49. And zoom in and out... whatever
50. Ok [laughs].
51. I don't know I did... yeah... this may or may not work. Usually works better with three people I thinkπ...
52. Yeah. ...I actually ... think that ...it does maybe sound confusing... what it is you're saying but it is confusing because the art is enormous and it's collective. There are many... many smaller issues in there that we can make ...really ...explicit through examples. And when there are many... many... many examples then you start questioning the art which is what you have just done. So it's not about Assemble... it's not about forensic architecture... it's about Turner Prize. So these two examples serve the purpose of showing us that we have as artists no space in Turner Prize. I think that my thinking comes from the care for art that is now totally ... bastardised through politics that you mentioned... through the institutional interests that are claimed to be public. And... and that's in incredibly compromised through memberships involved for example of these institutions the same way the fees that people are paying to be part of them. ...or to be enrolled in higher

education institutions that are now art schools. All of that cannot be ignored because it does create an agenda that removes the interest of art and artists from it... yet mobilises it for the purpose of selling itself as holistic. And I have deep... I'm deeply troubled by these situations because it was really comfortable to be this ...franchised together as artists. Of course there is [unclear 9:56] in arts world and we have taught and learnt about it but the percentage of people who survive as artists is so miniscule... that art can still be beautiful for us who are actually not necessarily involved in making a living out of it. But actually use it for our ethos or our values or our private time... for our socialising... for education. And I'm feeling that that social space of art has been taken away from me ... through rewarding practices that are seemingly devoid of class systems or politics or ...the local agendas that might be at play ah at the time of let's say a [unclear 10:58]. So even though I for example championed Assemble and ... used them as an example of collectivity ...with my own students... I think it is very important not to forget the fact that they are Cambridge graduates. And that has an implication ...in terms of their ...gender... the class that they come from... the discipline of art they are tackling... ..how they work together in the first place. And how they get rewarded and with what reward. So

53. But.
54. Yeah.
55. I mean would there be I wonder there is something here particularly about in terms of investigation... in terms of you know... speaking truth to power. ...is there something in particular about its self as constituted as art which allows an articulation of that which is a distinct ...which can [exhales] which speaks of all things you're say you're talking about... about class distinction... about gender etcetera. ...but has a particular way of ...now its very difficultly is the same kind of metaphors about reveal or about about err engagement that is other than. Because I mean it's interesting when you look at their... if you're talking about their place... their origins of kind of privilege
56.
57. ...and while they describe their activities in terms of art as a... I think this is my understanding so it maybe incorrect... they there is an ineffectiveness in the cases that they bring up. That seems that's one of one of the reservations that they have... that they're they're activities as artists ...somehow blunts their... what would have been a privilege anyway of their access to I mean whether that's wrong or right. And so that's part of their... there is that sort of not being taken

- seriously in in the court... European court or whatever and then there's the... but then there is the kind of devaluing of of... I think the business of... not so much entertainment but of ...of offering what might be considered as ...well I don't what it is. What is that aesthetic that
58. Mmm...
59. Occurs which is... that seems ... not necessary. I don't know
60. I don't think it is the aesthetic as much as it is the form. Architecture tends to be powerful if used by ... it'show how would say... history... perception... it is ...a kind of intellectual trait in the same way that forensic architecture comes with the kind of scholarly and academic background. And in that sense... it is really questionable about is it art in terms of what it is ...that it's trying to achieve. And it's one thing that you know we can see it is important but not all art is important... it still should be there. I love art that is not as spectacular as architecture and I feel like these prizes to forensic architecture or to Assemble has actually further disenfranchised art that is happening on a very... very small scale. That is actually to me much more important... that's impacting in society in a way that is not as visible. So th this is what I see problematic when something that's already taken itself outside of the ...art realm because it belongs to the field of architecture or belongs of field ...of whatever else. And then when it gets an arts prize... it get... it gets away with all the issues that might come from the architecture discipline itself because everything goes in arts... including that. And I just now suddenly after being so ...open and happy that [unclear 16:02] I'm actually having an urge... to do the opposite and be exclusive in a way and defend art from Assemble or forensic architecture. Which is kind of
61. But is
62. A paradox situation.
63. But is it [exhales]... is it the ...I am wondering whether sense in which [exhales] art as a category to coin someone else's... is a... is is an aristocratic category in that not necessarily and I'm now thinking of [unclear 16:39]
64. Mmm...
65. Not necessarily that it is ...ignoble or whatever but it's to do with
66. Yeah yeah... I understand.
67. It's to do with the training and that's why it it but the aristocracy for everybody or whatever. But the the the conferring of value obviously from the prize is is something that is... that either is not critically engaged and not not not articulated.

And that's what gives the recipient the double edge sense in which either it is... where is it? I can't... sort of curious... there's a curious

68. Mmm...

69. Vanity... which is in itself wonderfully human and frail no but it's not. It's it's I I'm wondering whether that's continuously the the thing that seems to be un not so much unavoidable that that artists in particular feel so complicit in in amongst everything else

70. Mmm...

71. That ...and then... and their renouncing of it could be something else but the possibly the... the line which is drawn where you can actually discuss those terms... the criteria about which things are brought into the realm... the public realm the... are distributed. ...and they seem in particular to be absent.

72. Mmm...

73. ...is that not actually... not a difficult thing to to confront in that one. I don't know.

74. I think if you have ...let's say forensic architecture centre based within the ...arts education institution... if you have the work exhibiting in institution of contemporary arts. If you have better visualisation being

championed as the kind of ... contemporary model... current ... art expression... then nobody will data... aestheticizing of data. If you had that as acceptable in terms ofthe skill that they use to... needingto employ in order to ...develop an art work... then it is not surprised that even the art prizes are going... art prizes are going to go with selection ofpeople that are working in the same area.

75. I was just thinking

76. I just don't consider that a progress... that's the thing [laughs].

77. Well... quite but is it... but it's also something that's that's quite regularly identifiable and

78. Easy if it's too easy actually

79. Too easy.

80. Maybe that's the problem. Yeah.

81. Because see [exhales] I think when were they talking about ...because if we are going to be reading anything [las].

82. Mmm... [laughs].

83. ... I think they've very consciously shifted the focus on those issues. I think they're trying to recognise that there are whole generations of artists that are not self-obsessed around just small and relevant

- things but are actually trying to tackle things that are difficult. ... that are not straightforward issues to discuss... that are messy truths... hard truths... complex realities.
84.
85.
86. But it's really interesting that they said there's a whole generation of artists... artists have always had the generation that didn't fall under the kind of ...populist understandings of what or who arts arts is. So this is not new... what they're saying is that they want to not see themselves as celebrity artists but that is a different thing.
87. Yeah. There's... the mixed feelings... it's strange time for us. On the one hand... there are a few cases that are working [unclear 21:08] struggled with. Which is kind of interesting you know with the the investigation of ...you know the Israeli village of Umm al-Hiran. But the incident that took place was destroyed... it's kind of an interesting sort of aside. Alright... that's a that's a that's a difficulty for an inconvenience or whatever... I I it's peculiar how [exhales]
88. I almost want to ask them... "but where have you been?" You know... I'm... I've been existing in arts for the last 20 years very happily as miniscule non-celebrity artist that managed to survive out of few quite lovely projects with people that like I don't know if I made any impact. It sounded at the time and sometimes I want to feel and believe that some kind of visible qualities of the contact that I had with these people are actually the product of me once having that contact. But then you know... to to assume that ... once upon a time when we... when we... when these artists that we now know were were the artists... they were no others... is kind of quite sad ah? I wouldn't like to believe that when I don't know... Michelangelo was working... there was only Michelangelo [laughing] you know.
89. But I suppose also you know in terms it's a bit of description of architecture but... that... about the function of design... I mean obviously there's a number of... working with the V&A and designing things as well. But whether there's that... that in itself is a definition of... of user usability of service... service for example. And that... that's quite distinct from their... and it's understandable that an individuals taken the idea of how art is is made... is but is kind of continues to ...assert itself and. I don't know... but even the the the the criticisms are... is it actually architecture anyway? But or what... but the... now this is one of the reasons why I wondered whether it... how it plays upon the idea of a... of a kind of a

- radical... activist... ..alternative...
institutional play... which I didn't
know whether that's something
that that would be relevant to how
90.
91. [Unclear 23:48] ...you know where...
each even where [unclear 23:54] you
know one argues the intellectuals
who are not satisfied with lending
their voice to the discourse of the
state and the commodity should
organise different forms... different
spaces of expression and distribution
of ideas. I mean... easily said. ...
but in in that sense... but that's...
that goes... there's always going
to be come up with the ongoing
problematic alternative.
92. Yeah... and also... I mean if you
draw public funding... if you
attended ... an education that
is ... you know privileged... if
you are able to administrate the
obtaining of the very difficult sites
..... ..that actually speaks about
your privilege of being able to
communicate with the councils or
residents or whatever... whatever.
And if you were also accepting the
prize and not using that minute of
your acceptance speech to actually
say something that's not expected
from you... then you are actually
totally compliant. Simply because
you can organise differently but
that means from the beginning.
93. Yeah... no absolutely.
- Totally of course. ...
94. I understand that it's hard
though... completely.
95. Yeah... that's... that's [unclear 25:15]
96. And... and it's it's not like
hard in terms of ...it takes me a
lot of time... or it's intellectually
challenging. No... you are
politically compromised. It's
ethically challenging. It's it's it's...
.....alsothe to arrive... to an
action point sometimes that journey
makes that action unimportant.
Because if that journey is going
to compromise your values up to
the level that ... the action at the
end of it is totally ...irrelevant...
if you're going to become another
person in that whole journey
97. Although that is the
98. [Laughs] then what is... what
is the point of that action?
99. ...but this makes me think of your
own self and that's one of the reasons
why I was interested in kind of
100.
101. Continuing 'cause you know...
you're involved in numerous
ongoing ... projects. But...
no that's when I went to
very... very interesting
102.

103. Just as a... and I wondered what you... because I saw you at the point think that was a... almost like a misunderstanding wasn't it because they got the wrong date
104.
105. And I wondered how reflections on that were... were were going. Because even on on the on the evening I arrived
106.
107. There was you know just little other narratives that were
108.
109. Occurring where either LCP taking the place in Elephant and Castle
110. Mmm...
111. In the shopping precinct
112.
113. In the glass bowl
114.
115. ... with a degree of visibility.
116. Mmm...
117. ... and still... the kind of the interesting residents group that
118.
119. Came up... which was not... didn't... I I don't think... I
120. Yeah... yeah.
121. But it still... it kind of still offered these
122. Mmm...
123. Opportunities for ... for exchange. But again... and as to what you were just saying
124.
125. About what it is that actually makes the
126.
127. Effect. ...and I wondered how that project itself was was was progressing. I mean I don't know whether that's somethings that's that's ...kind of interweaved with your view... occupation with your... with your job as a
128. Mmm...
129. As a an educator
130. No... we are all obligated in it and it would be foolish not to admit that. ...but we don't have permission for continuing with the project. So I don't know what is going to happen with the building itself. But our building ...

the LCC building... ..is ... from what I understand ... losing the lease ...so something has to be done and now it's the matter of how is it that going to be executed so the least amount of people are hurt.

131. Gosh... as even as much as that. It seems... I mean I was kind of quite... with everything around that area is so depressing ...and that
132. Yeah... there's a lot
133. The overriding
134. Of activism going on around it. But you know... we started talking about you know you providing this kind of massive art and then millions of the smaller ones ... within it and I think maybe that is... maybe that is the problem. Because one of the residents might say that the problem is not the flats that they have an issue with in that building... the problem is the whole of the capitalism and then you come to hunt. You cannot make
135. You can't get passed that.
136. It it and yeah... you can't make a solution. So... so that is the thing... how how to tackle things one by one when they are really totally layered and convoluted and also they require... I mean incredibly social awareness that we are losing so quickly and people just do not have an attitude towards compassion...

collegialism... togetherness... .. solidarity... ..because it seems to have been much clearer once upon a time or maybe we were just nostalgic about how things worked

137. Are you... .. well could you break that down just a little bit
138. Mmm...
139. Because are you talking about the the places the educational institution at are in that res in that area? Are you talking about local government? Are you talking about how residents organise
140.
141. To ...resist
142.
143. ...and all of these ones are... is it the ongoing grinding down... the deliberate obfuscation of of of a... the possibility of access to a kind... ah ah an act an action that is effective that is
144. Yeah.
145. To a voice that is heard and that and that and something that is listened to against a ...I can't think of anything else other than the sort of the George Orwellian boot on the face of humanity for all of eternity. ...the I mean this is always this... the this is the continual dilemma isn't it

146.
147. The ongoing dilemma of effective resistance.
148. Yeah. Mmm...
149. And... I mean it was kind... but I wondered whether there is something in the in the way in which ...communicative discourse made... ways in which things are understood that can be are organisational but cut against or make different forms of spaces and expression. ... which ... [exhales] aren't just about being different and Avant Garde
150. Mmm...
151. Abo... against... above but are critically attuned but I mean this what you mean... I think then about about aptitude of ...oh god... well it's either stamina or else there's for for for those who either cannot participate or have got no option because they are participating... they have been removed. ...[exhales]
152. It's almost like having the courage to denounce oneself. And it's... it's very difficult I I completely understand that but it's like... you're constantly feeling that through the system that already are existent... you're supposed to defend yourself. But if the system is crooked from the start... then you need to invent a parallel one that is even more effective from that one that already
- has the power... that has support... that dominates... that has a history... that's technically the most valid. You know... in that kind of sense you're asked a lot of one person ... because it seems that every issue is the same. Like with you know we spoke about something as silly as the Turner Prize but it's the same like you know... it's this week I think it's the ...anniversary of Grenfell Tower I think and ...you just think you know what has happened is just like... yeah let's get a better a cladding. You can just do that... that's very simple. But actually the issues that sprung out of that incident are again let's take capitalism down [laughs] I don't know... art you know. If
153. Of course.
154. Yet everything goes from something really miniscule suddenly to the this power politics structures in... it's just... we are affected by it on a daily basis and every minute of our lives that you cannot just ignore it. You cannot not speak about it but you the moment you engage you disempower yourself. It's total paradox.
155. There is something of that Stalinist aspect that the small and everything that you've said you know... you began with the small detail about the incidents about one fact... but the accumulation of the the larger lie is the thing

156.
157. That that overrides... which is aye... which is how I guess Twitter Trump all operates. But it
158.
159. But I... again coming back to this one you know so
160.
161. With Grenfell ...whether h... somebody else was saying that I mean... that... is that a useful way of of relooking at how well is it is it... just reduction to spectacle or is there a way in is there a way
162. Mmm... So spectacle is very important and you said that in the at at the beginning when when we were kind of ...making this art as I keep calling it... I don't know why. But ...you ...mentioned performance
163.
164. And it if it's definitely part of thismedia world and part of the political strategy. This is something that is absolutely paralysing action because action is also being equated with performance. They're not two thing things.
165. How would you... how do you regard maybe I don't know ... Judith Butler the idea of
166. Mmm...
167. And I get the idea of Assembly
168.
169. Of of the the the perform... performative
170. Mmm...
171. Of the... ..the performative action that's probably you know at the Arab spring etcetera as a as a popular ...performative act that actually overrides and directly addresses... not even addresses ...some good old fashioned militancy that ... [exhales] I don't know. The it the in an idea of a performative is double edged in that it's... yes there is something that the... that ... seems to speak about theatricality and about spectacle and about
172. Mmm...
173. Front and about something that is ...its almost something that's plutonic you know about
174. Mmm...
175. That's not key to truth but there is also something about ...let's go... I mean because it it comes up... the idea of the cynic... the idea of the Foucault's idea of parrhesia ... and the old fashion of aspect that we look back action and we act directly. ...we collect that and that

is... that supersedes... it's ...it's not a theatrical aspect not... although actually... possibly these things are not as ...black and white as one imagines. And that... I wonder where also whether that's not so much explains but it kind of does still talk about why there's this greyish area where we become as a what... I have a suspicion that artists allow themselves to be involved in this ambiguity where things need not be ambig ambiguous. But at the same time... the ambiguity actually is does articulate something about how how closely we we we do need to regard things. And that's it's difficulty in in it and it's bodily embodiment that it's it's action.

erratic you know... how woman were always kind of taken into the mental health arena because they have been projecting ...disagreement through even kind of ... bodily ... discontent in all sorts of ways.

176. Mmm...

181. Hysteria.

177. ...[exhales] and in the guise of power... it is something that can be reduced.

182. Yeah. So ...or for the... let's say for the ethnic minorities... you know... the movement of the hands you know or ...the high level ...pitch when you are talking about something has been unacceptable because it appears as shouting whilst you're just having a different type of accent talking about something it was.

178. ...it's not any reduced... it's been misinterpreted in two ways.

183. The passions.

179. Ah yes.

184. So so this isthis is not ...unusual

180. It's cancelling ...gender differences... it's cancelling culture differences because the moment you start acting outside of what's considered the norm which is often to do with let' say with the management... ..that ismm the kind of ... per performative training. So... if you are coming outside of those values... you're immediately ...

185. No.

186. And it you know it's not the first time it happens... but what pains me as ...as as an artist in this story is that performance take with itself a skill and this is how we started talking and it also takes yearly training and ... endurance. And this is something that's taken out of the equation because the performance in terms of management is only an effect. So it's only the final aesthetic

187. Effect or affect?

188. ...maybe both... but I would say only what's spectacular... only what's visible... only what's for the moment... only what's captured. Whilst in the theatre let's say or wherever you're looking at the performance... you're actually in the immersed experience where you are learning how to value somebody's engagement with this particular skill for a very long time. So... that endurance is taken out of action and you're just ... faced with a value of something that is incredibly temporary.
189. But that's a particular definition of performance as either as virtuosic
190. Mmm...
191. Or the way that we were talking about art as an aristocratic view of of in in of rare fact or intense sort of
192.
193. Tutelage I would have... but it may not be. It may well be just the about... about recategorizing how... how [unclear 41:44] considerations are are made that that all things [unclear 41:52] for want of a better word there is a ... democratic way which all al gestures
194.
195. I mean I'm... are included ...are articulations
196. Mmm...
197. Are ...are not necessarily co-defined... yeah I think I'm being a bit you know off topic here.
198. [Laughs]
199. ...but again
200. No no no I think you're right... I think you're right because I mean it does you know ...it seems that the kind of world of management is the only one that's ... considered itself professional. So it's... what what we lose as artists is you know... you you were saying earlier we are complicit because we ...engage with ambiguity but we have always been loving complexities. We have always been interested... inquisitive about things that are confusing. I do not mind lending myself in some causes that are quite you know... difficult or uncertain or you know what I mean. And this seems to be incredibly unwelcome now because... if you do not have like an... the outcome that is straightforward
201. Sure.
202. This is what I'm saying... the whole world is now in management. Everybody's into some kind [laughing] of ... you know managing this or managing that or considering that is a job that you don't want to learn. That you just ...allocated a title so you are suddenly chairing

- or managing or in charge... actually you're not... that is like with all arts discipline. Incredible skill that needs to be developed... learnt... trained... experienced. But we just seem to be loving being in charge [laughs] and perform... yeah... not even loving being in charge having that
203. [someone enters room]
204. Hi.
205. ?Hi
206. How was that performance?
207. ?Sorry to interrupt... I'm looking for Juan. He's doing the five years project this afternoon.
208. Is he?
209. ?In the park.
210. Ah yes... of course he is.
211. ?Yeah.
212. I haven't seen him.
213. ?He's probably in the park isn't he.
214. Yeah... he hasn't come in. He hasn't said anything yet.
215. ?You haven't seen him yet?
216. No... he hasn't
217. ?That's fine.
218. But I'll
219. ?Let him know its Sophie.
220. Yeah... ok.
221. ?If he comes. Thanks.
222. Yeah... anyway. [Laughs].
223. No... the thing about management as well... but it's the guise that things are being listened to... that there is an engaged activity where there is reciprocity. Whereas
224. Mmm...
225. Something you know of value... of of participation
226. Mmm...
227. Participatory as if it is
228. Mmm...
229. Actually that when in fact of course it's about maximising the... the agenda.
230. Mmm...
231. The agenda is as we've said is
232. Mmm...
233. Maximising profit. But there is this there's the guile or the the I wonder why... I wonder whether it... art... theatricals of the ar

- arts... is is so sought after and creative industries are... are.
234. Mmm...
235. As a... as a tool of of of ...of delusion and that self-delusion
236. Mmm...
237. It's something that came up... and that's whether that's also to do with the politics as well but and that's another... it's an occupational hazard of of dealing with an ambiguity
238. Mmm...
239. ...which means whether it's... there's an ethical question that's been asked or whether it's a political question that's been asked. Well and by... by maintaining that art atheistic it it deludes the question of of ethics and politics and that's where it becomes... there's a compromise. I don't know... I mean no I'm not sure or there's the accusation of of compromise... the accusation of well... this is a continual return of ...what it's like to be an artist and to name it art.
240. Yeah and and compromises has become a dirty word because it's just... yeah... it means negotiating and working on something together. And we do not negotiate terrorists so in... when you position yourself like that... then you are bound to... once you do it
241.
242. Totally diminish this kind of massive ...value that you placed yourself under. ...and you end up being silly... looking looking silly and dishonest or whatever. I don't know... maybe the question is how to be honest rather than devise some strategy that's going to work... like how to keep yourself honest in all of that.
243. And also [exhales] the pragmatics of compromise which is what's
244. Mmm...
245. Being said. So... where... [pause] ...where there is a wrong there's no point in... that it would be wrong to deny that it is wrong and where there is something that can be compromised which ...but is that about temper... is about tempering ...and obviously it's negotiation about contest and about a resolution
246. Mmm...
247. ...but that's to do with being in a position of equals whereas there is a [laughing] it's the sense in which it is unsaid that you you behave as if you are speaking the the truth and that there is a genuine engagement and whether that is not the case
248. Mmm...
249. And that you are you know...

whether that's a sort of
 thinking obviously of kind of a
 Foucauldian sort of divided

250. It's also I think... one's own ...
 history like ...my my ideal solidarity
 might be completely different than
 than what what might be taken as
 ...somebody's else's. I I have like
 serious issues with ...activism that
 has been done by I don't know...
 middle class liberal groups ...in this
 country. Because I I don't have that
 tradition... I don't have that heritage.
 So... when I'm faced with it... I'm
 just like I'm in shock that somebody
 could call themselves do-gooder
 when there is such an obvious harm
 that is done to the side that seems to
 be protected in this [laughing] kind
 of bubble of understanding of what
 it is that might might be engaged
 here. ...but then on the other hand...
 the way I might be speaking about
 one side or another... might appear
 so much unprotective of whoever
 it is that is on the receiving...
 receiving end. So... there's a lot ...
 we carry ourselves that ...often ...
 misunderstood and we seem to be
 thinking that we are together. But...
 but actually ...I don't think we have
 ever been as indoctrinated and
 isolated as we are now in our belief
 that we know what communal...
 commons... togetherness...
 solidarity... democracy means. I've
 never been in the situation and it's
 not that I've lived hundreds of years
 but I have never been in the situation
 where that was as confusing. That

was to me never confusing and it's
 funnelling out and you know... I
 spend my young days in dictatorship
 so it was very easy to be you know
 position. 'Cause you knew what's
 wrong... but now it's actually quite
 difficult finding myself here... it is
 incredibly difficult. I mean we came
 to a point ...last week... we spoke
 about getting the drink together as
 a group and there was suddenly
 so many people... we just wanted
 to go and have a drink together.

251.
252. But... the implication of what pub
 means for people who don't drink...
 for the international people...
 for the working class... for the...
 you're just like... I just thought...
 my God... can we just go and get a
 drink like any. I mean it just became
 far too complicated... just need to
 socialise... that's the urgency. It's
 not about the drink. It's like oh
 my God! [Laughing] like what...
 where is the... you know how's
 the... where's this gone? How's
 how how are we allowed to lose the
 focus up to the level that it became
 about personal politics and this is
 actually an issue... that we are not
 every talking about politics. You are
 talking about personal politics here.
253.
254. People are just far too selfish in terms
 of their own backgrounds to in a way
 compromise with somebody else

who might come from completely different set up. And we are unable to make the friends that are going to accommodate all those extremes ...

255. Is that the face-to-face?
256. I think that's becoming incredibly ... incredibly difficult. We thought... I have witnessed with younger members of staff who ...are coming into arts... into teaching... into institutions. ...the real discomfort with a social situations... the real ... incapacity... inability to take on ...some of the conversations on an incredibly simple level. That if you're asked to move the glass... that's all that you've been asked to.
257. So you know in some ways it is a performative dilemma.
258. Yeah.
259. About how to perform... and you know the question of received code of of shared code... of or even the the negotiation of process of of being together
260. Yeah.
261. Is ...but I wonder if that is... is it also to do with a... just an ongoing virtual distance? Or is that just too
262. I think that plays a huge part. I also think that ...the inability of us to create something real causes people to dive into utopias. People

are really creating their own worlds where things are working the way they... they're becoming more and more isolated. Because these worlds are you know... have started having legs ...becoming vivid in terms in of the aesthetics generating community. Even if it is like only likes and we know that it means nothing... actually that experience is becoming quite immersive. That... that experience of nothingness... which is just an impulse actually now starts building into a world. And in that kind of senseespecially if it's err to do with creatives... it becomes a value. It becomes a value with which you defend yourselves against the reality. And we are first ones who professionally understand how important that is. But then... how to say to an artist... "ok... at this particular moment you need to stop being artist because first and foremost you're a colleague or you're a citizen... you're a woman... you're like... can we just drop... can we just drop this ... you know... what whatever... whatever world you ma made ... for I don't know... personal pleasure is star... is starting communally about how to do things."

263. Is that a private public dichotomy?
264. I think that it is. I think that is so alsointerconnected... intersec... I think that is very much confused. I think it's because of

-conditions in work ...we spend most of our times working... therefore our social relationships
265. [Unclear 55:47]
266. Yeah. Social relationships are almost exclusively work relationships. With these ...
267. But working for the benefit of... well working with the goal of of of the private... of the defence of the private.
268. yeah maybe. I don't know... I just... I don't even know what private is any more considering
269. No and I think it
270. The level... the level of this interrogations
271. Yeah.
272. You know. And now with the... also the legislation of this. And the enthusiasm for legislative... oh my God. That is also kind of quite shocking. ...the kind of... the interest of people to police or devise a policy for simple social interactions is... is incredible. It's a kind of ...an admission that we cannot do it ourselves... among ourselves. That there needs to be a policy in terms of how we address each other. It is [laughing] just disheartening
273. As a protection of property or protection of self or protection of
274. Yeah... I guess both but as soon as you are in the protection... you're talking about one. As soon as you are defending something... you you that means others are excluded. As soon as
275. But [exhales] what about the the fetish for for deregulation? I mean
276. Yeah... I mean I'm not not going into kind of situations international kind of level of it but... ..yeah I don't yeah I don't know how to solve it.
277. [Laughs]
278. I'm just thinking you know... I sent an email to everybody saying "hi... you know... I'm doing this conversation... you know... does anyone want to come and see Edward and me?" And then I thought... actually I need to now put a disclaimer... "if you want to opt [laughing] out of this email list." Like you know... it's just like it's a constant battle between how much you can ask people to do. How much is expected of me? How much... it's always and and it's not only legalisation... it's also monetisation that we have often brought to ourselves by trying to protect the err profession as artists. We are now over monetising

- what it is that we want to be doing too. Often we are very much interested in how much this is going to cost for me to come here and have an hour of conversation. That's my valuable my time that I'm normally spending elsewhere as a... people don't anymore think in terms of... I just want to contribute. Doesn't exist as such... people are now thinking in order to defend whatever professional mean... I have to be setting the standard of a particular rate... in order to allow others allegedly to be paid too. But it's no... it is about the self and the fact that you do not want to cause any and do something for free just because you feel an urge as a citizen... you're always now projecting an artist... performing an artist.
279. Yes... and somebody else's art and it's not yours... and you are material for others.
280. Yeah. Yeah.
281. Which... you know... which is a pretty... it's a difficult one to kind of ...communicate
282. Yes [laughs].
283. With the... with the with the emphasis on common and communicate about what that might be whereas... rather than the [unclear 59:31] the thing that is actually being passed.
284. Yes.
285. INTThat is being shared or being made.
286. Yes.
287. ...
288. I just came back ... from Sarajevo. I was there last week and it is a kind of still quite umm err a scene of... a site of of trauma. And there's a huge ... of presence of the international community there that is ...really openly hated by all the ... locals. And it is like one of the most devastating things that I heard but ... it's also acc accepting this because ...kind of liberal westies against the violence... but they have been saying that they should have let us finish the war. Because this... what they found themselves in... is worse than how it was. And it's... and even just what to say on that... is somebody with the experience of that spoke for themselves fully aware of what that means.
289. [Exhales]
290. So the the this is this a
291. The past is... is yeah
292. But you know
293. Never as panful as the oreset.
294. Speaking about direct action...

- this is you know and liberalism of you know. This is... this is what it means that... we we want things done without casualties. We want things done without ourselves being hurt... we want things done without compromising our property rights and all this. But the things done are far too big for all of those not to be compromised.
295.
296. And this... that's [laughs]... that's the conundrum.
297. Yes. Collateral damage.
298. [Laughs] yes. Yes. So... it's almost like we need a strategy within which we need volunteers in terms of that collateral damage. Which is how ISIS operates very successfully [laughing].
299. Well... I was thinking absolutely no... I think it is... the ... genius system it really is.
300. Yeah.
301. But that's
302. [Laughing]
303. You got to hand it to religion though... it does have a
304. Yeah.
305. A way with the
306. Yeah... they have the right... the art is
307. When it comes to the delusion
308. Yeah... yeah. The art is in the
309. When it comes to the delusion.
310. Yeah... yeah. The art... they got right. We we cannot define the art
311. Yeah.
312. But they got it right.
313. Well yes... yes [exhales]
314. Or how how to distil comments into the ideology. [Laughs]
315. Well every act is is is is is collected is is yeah.
316. [Laughs]
317. No detail too small. No... no catastrophe too big.
318. Yes. Yeah. ...yeah I do I do worry about the kind of ...the road that artists ... play in all of this. ... especially... especially because when when when there is a... an unexpected... when in in terms of this kind of world making... when we do draw it out... often it's it's been assumed that ...we are there to call out what's invisible... make visible what's invisible sometimes. And it's worked very... very well

- with the I don't know... Nonny de la Pana gathering... all the rumours about Guantanamo Bay and then visualising that and then the actual footage from the place that's... was assumed called like that and people were tortured is actually then released as as a reality because she has called it through the images that she created as a potential that this actually exists. And that's suddenly... the government defend themselves by saying yes... here are they are in in a way. But also accepting that something shouldn't maybe visualised so. Maybe we
319. Something shouldn't be visualised?
320. Maybe... maybe. Maybe... maybe we think of our role in the society as being too holy.
321. Holy?
322. Yeah. Maybe we... we don't have the right to... to do somethings that we imagined we can. I don't know.
323. Right... well... Where to begin with that? It's... whether it's... yes... it's a sort of prohibition on... on the image.
324. Yeah it's like... you know thinking of Margaret Atwood making ...the Handmaid's Tale in Europe... creating this utopian world that I'm looking to Trump as the reality as as as existing as becoming as you know. And
325. That can't be utopian that.
326. But this is what I'm saying like... I'm thinking... are we giving people ideas? [Laughs] Like [laughing]
327. Well... when you look through history and most of those dictators either went to art school or did dabble
328. Yes... so yeah... where where is
329. The inexorable link to a certain degree of romanticism which is very unfair but... I mean... you know. The evidence speaks for itself.
330. Yeah.
331. ...yes... which is to do with the material of the other as collateral.
332.
333. You know... hence the suspicion.
334.
335. But that's... you know... but that's the... that [unclear 1:06:02] politics the ...the politicisation of aesthetics.
336. Yeah. Yeah... because it's not it's also you know... even if you're thinking about thislike an non-effective virtual world... there is so much studies. There is an art work actually that I've seen in this in the Imperial War Museum in 9/11 exhibition of you know...

- the kind of mental conditions and I've actually witnessed umm err one not of a soldier but of a... a police officer who is not in the field ...but actually works on the CCTV footage. I mean... you know... the the ... the developing of the insanity through the process of remotely participating in something. So this work on 9/11 ...in in the exhibition at the Imperial War Museum of the soldiers who just kind of flew over the areas and through the screen dropped the bombs and that kind of sense not feel that they have done anything. And the trauma that they were under... the guilt. So the recognition that they have been implicated even though it does seem totally remote. ...
337. Well that is part of that banality of evil is it not.
338. Mmm...
339. That's the administrat... the administer... administered society which you know... distance is implication
340. Mmm...
341. And everything that you've spoken about... about connectivity and their responsible which is a kind of a Levinas thing of the of the ethical
342. Mmm...
343. As being face-to-face and the difficulty of of of that
- to to retrieve from that.
344. Mmm...
345. Which... could be you know... could be disputed anyway but because [laughs] but yeah... I don't... but that is... but that's also what's what's laid at the door of the image of the spectacle about the effect of something [unclear 1:08:06] which you know. You know which makes it all the more ...difficult and wrong and evil and if nothing else... that's the prohibition of the image is it not.
346. Yeah. And it's also
347. [Laughs] crassly put.
348. Yeah. And I mean... it's also this kind of ... belief that ...you know... a philosopher also can be a an image... a celebrity... a goal... a manager. And in that kind of sense... removed from... you know you can write about the the fantastic engagement in the society and then be a complete horrible person ...when it comes to the actual how you action this yourself. And often... we have an interest to kind of keep this professional... this kind of the writing about it is a... is somebody's professionalism has nothing to do with the horrible way that he or she behaves because she writes so well you know. And
349.

350. If if... to me it's ...
351. Judging by your actions
352. Well... I guess yes and no but I must say that I I was in in awe of Judy Butler when ...she came to promote ...her on Assembly in Belgrade and she sat at the conference listening to other people's papers after providing keynote.
353. Mmm...
354. I mean... that doesn't happen.
355. Does it not?
356. Doesn't happen anymore.
357. Gosh.
358. And... you know... she
359. ...oh gosh.
360. She sat
361. Oh right.
362. She sat with her iPad on the stage... being asked questions for almost three hours. The ones that she didn't manage to answer she ... started the conversation the day after with... ...called the people from the audience who asked her that question and said... you know "sorry I couldn't do it last night... so I'm just going to do it now."
363.
364. And you just think... you know whatever it is that you write... I'm going to care about. I mean it's... ...you know you can call this a market... a marketing campaign
365. Yes as if she happened to [laughs]
366. You know.
367. In between there was... you know... doing bad things but you know
368. Yeah... yeah. You can call it whatever you like but... you know... it it hasn't gone unnoticed by... by anyone [laughs].
369. Ah yeah... it gets... it's the thing that keeps it... the furore was a wonderful dancer yes.
370. Yes... there you go.
371. Right... I think... shall we... enough.
372. Yeah.
373. Not on that end I am going to remove [laughs]
374. Yeah. Ok... do you want to
375. Stop. Well... I don't know. Who knows.
376. Yeah... we were talking about funerals but today is the wedding [laughs].

377. It is very difficult [exhales]. Again... I think the the possibility was... is this the equivalent of taking notes of of what it is that happens if... if at all. And... and... I guess there are two ways of the kind of enquiring is you ambush yourself and try and figure out if there's something that occurs all the way
378.
379. If that's a spontaneity... if that's ever... ever possible. And then we didn't do the... the reading that's
380. The closing... we started... we only started talking.
381. Yeah.
382. But
383. Which I'm... I'm kind of
384. Yeah.
385. I mean one of the things [exhales]... maybe I shouldn't have said this but one of the things it was... this this this question of drawing and it's something I would kind of quite like to investigate as a communicative ...enquiring
386. Mmm...
387. Thing that... that goes through and in and out of language.
388.
389. So there are things which can be said... things
390.
391. That can be ...which is again is something that ...that [unclear 1:12:46] you know... bring us back to Aristotle wasn't it... that ...politics is what defines the human as political is that they have the ability to speak
392. Mmm...
393. And have language and the voice is something other.
394. Hiya.
395. Hi.
396. Hiya.
397. ?Hello.
398. Are you coming in for
399. ?We are undergraduate.
400. Fantastic.
401. [Laughs]
402. ?:[Unclear 1:13:14]
403. Alright.
404. [Background noise/speaking]
405. There is a toilet... there's no bath.

406. [Laughter]

407. Ok.

408. Thank you very much for your

409. No... it's ok. It's a pleasure [laughs].

410. I think having more... doing
it as a group it would be
better. Are you in Juan?

411. ?;Yeah.

412. Somebody was looking for you.

413. [Interviewer continues to speak
with another person... voice very
distant and unable to transcribe]

414. Audio ends: [1:14:46]

